Peer Review Team Report

Barstow Community College 2700 Barstow Rd. Barstow, CA 92311

This report represents the findings of the Peer Review Team that conducted a focused site visit to Barstow Community College February 18th to February 19th, 2025. The Commission acted on the accredited status of the institution during its June 2025 meeting and this team report must be reviewed in conjunction with the Commission's Action letter.

Dr. David Martin Team Chair

Table of Contents

Peer Review Team Roster – Team ISER Review	3
Peer Review Team Roster – Focused Site Visit	3
Purpose of Focused Site Visit and Summary Analysis	4
Major Findings	6
Standard 1	7
Standard 2	9
Standard 3	14
Standard 4	19
Verification of Required Documentation	22
Standard 1: Mission and Institutional Effectiveness	22
Standard 2: Student Success	23
Standard 3: Infrastructure and Resources	26
Standard 4: Governance and Decision-Making	27
Other Federal Regulations and Related Commission Policies	27

Barstow Community College

Peer Review Team Roster – Team ISER Review and Focused Site Visit

Dr. David Martin, Team Chair Sierra Community College Vice President, Administrative Services

Dr. Kristina Whalen, Vice Chair Foothill Community College President

ACADEMIC MEMBERS

Dr. Chad Redwing Modesto Junior College Professor of Humanities

ADMINISTRATIVE MEMBERS

Dr. Natalie Schonfeld Coastline Community College Dean of Counseling, Student Services

Shawn Kern Moorpark Community College Research Analyst

ACCJC STAFF LIAISON

Melynie Schiel Accrediting Commission for Community and Junior Colleges Vice President

Purpose of Focused Site Visit and Summary Analysis

INSTITUTION: Barstow Community College

DATES OF VISIT: February 18th and 19th, 2025

TEAM CHAIR: Dr. David Martin

Purpose of the Focused Site Visit

This Peer Review Team Report is based on the findings of the peer review team which conducted its evaluation and analysis over a two-semester comprehensive peer review process. In October 2024, the team conducted a Team ISER Review (formative component) to identify where the Institution meets Standards and to identify Core Inquiries that specify areas of attention for the Focused Site Visit (summative component). The team chair and vice chair held a pre-Focused Site Visit meeting with the institution CEO on October 24th, 2024, to discuss updates since the Team ISER Review and to plan for the Focused Site Visit.

A five-member peer review team conducted a Focused Site Visit to Barstow Community College on February 18th and 19th, 2025, for the purpose of completing its Peer Review Team Report and determining of whether the Institution continues to meet Accreditation Standards, Eligibility Requirements, Commission Policies, and U.S. Department of Education regulations. During the Focused Site Visit, team members met with approximately fifty faculty, administrators, classified staff, and students in formal meetings, group interviews, and individual interviews. The team held an open forum which was well attended and provided the Institution community and others to share their thoughts with members of the Focused Site Visit team. The team evaluated how well the Institution is achieving its stated purposes, providing recommendations for quality assurance and institutional improvement. The team thanks the Institution staff for hosting the Focused Site Visit, coordinating meetings, providing additional documentation, and ensuring a smooth and collegial process.

Summary Analysis

Barstow Community College (BCC) has served communities in San Bernardino County and all the way east to the Nevada border since 1960, with a total service area of 9,200 square miles. BCC initially began holding classes on the Barstow High School campus before transitioning to its own campus in 1964, which is the location where BCC currently resides today. Since the initial six-building campus, the college has expanded over the years through the addition of new facilities such as a Performing Arts Center, Wellness Center, and most recently, a new Career & Technical Education (CTE) Complex. While areas around BCC have grown in population over the years, BCC's immediate service area has remained constant at approximately 25,000 residents. BCC serves a diverse student population with its largest student demographic (52%) identifying as Hispanic. Due to the college's proximity to the Fort Irwin Military Base, the college has developed strong connections and academic and support programs for members of the United States Military.

BCC is strongly committed to its mission, student success, and equitable student outcomes. The college has developed tailored academic and support programs to meet the educational needs of its community. BCC prioritizes student achievement and the elimination of equity gaps in their institutional planning documents and campus governance discussions. College resources are allocated through a process that links student success and achievement of institutional goals with available funding. BCC is consistently monitoring its student achievement goals and discussing the expansion of future benchmarks for the college to strive for. BCC has developed processes and platforms for the collection and analysis of student demographic and achievement data while continuously striving to identify areas for future improvement to ensure the college is serving its students in a manner that promotes their individual academic goals.

BCC employs a dedicated and committed workforce that takes pride in the institution and its ability to effectively serve and support students in its rural location. During the comprehensive review process, the college community highlighted the numerous programs and services available to BCC students, such as the High Desert Youth Summit and the Better Mynd Program. Moreover, they enumerated myriad ways the campus, both the main campus and Fort Irwin, serve as an important touchpoint for the larger community. As a small but mighty institution, the staff, administration, students, and faculty are committed to collegewide collaboration and teamwork to ensure student success through academic programming, student support services, and community connections.

It is evident that BCC is dedicated to providing proper learning environments through prioritization and funding of capital improvement projects, such as the ongoing campuswide infrastructure installation. Additionally, it was noted during the Focused Site Visit that the institution had recently revised its policy on distance education and is in the final stages of approval in the Academic Senate. This revision includes requiring regular and substantive interaction (RSI) as well as the commitment to updating faculty distance education training and requires that all faculty participate in the updated distant education training program, for which they will be compensated. BCC is a state-wide leader in distance education, and they are encouraged to continue to maintain their high expectations and high-quality distance education by making sure that all distance education courses incorporate RSI and follow the guidelines in the updated distance education policy.

Major Findings

Recommendations for Compliance:

Recommendation 1: In order to meet the Standard, the team recommends the College ensures regular and substantive interaction is occurring in all its distance education courses (Standard 2.6, Policy on Distance Education and Correspondence Education)

Required Documentation:

The Institution submitted the required documentation per the Accreditation Standards.

Standard 1

Mission and Institutional Effectiveness

General Observations:

Barstow Community College's mission, program review, and well-integrated planning process allow the institution to reflect and modify its practices to better serve students by improving student outcomes. Through regular evaluation, assessment, reflection, resource allocation, and planning, BCC ensures that programs align with and support the Educational Master Plan. All of these elements contribute to the College's institutional effectiveness.

Findings and Evidence:

Barstow Community College uses participatory governance to ensure that student and community perspectives are evident in planning and the development of an updated college mission. BCC's mission is clearly defined and reflects its commitment to serving its unique location and student demographics, including military personnel and historically marginalized student populations. The mission also reflects the BCC's character, values, and structure by highlighting its commitment to providing equitable, accessible, and affordable education to an economically disadvantaged region through its various degree, certification, and CTE programs. (1.1)

Barstow Community College establishes goals for improvement, innovation, and equitable student outcomes through its Institution-Set Standards (ISS). Goals and standards are used to reflect on college trends and to support decision-making, priority-setting, and planning. Following the pandemic, the ISS floor and stretch rates remained unchanged, but in 2023 were updated to reflect the 3-year average and will be utilized for next year's evaluation cycle. Goals pertaining to equitable student outcomes are consistently prioritized in initiatives at the institutional level, as well as in committees and program review. For example, the institution has embedded goal setting as a practice in program and department program review along with activities to support reflection and review of how efforts and activities contribute to mission, standard, and goal fulfillment. Individual committees have also set manageable, measurable goals. Additionally, BCC established goals in its Strategic Plan that align with the California Community College Chancellor's Office (CCCCO) Vision for Success (VFS) Initiative. (1.2)

The college holds itself accountable through its established ISS and Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) and communicates the standards with committees and the public through the college website. Metrics are reviewed and submitted annually to the ACCJC and presented to the college Institutional Effectiveness Committee (IEC). Program review prompts all programs and services to reflect on ISS, and an updated program review template will ask authors to describe corrective actions when targets are missed. Institutional evaluation reports are available online and ISS trend data is available to the Program Review Subcommittee and IEC. Disaggregated institutional data are available on Tableau and are used to inform the continuous improvements and planning of instructional programs, committees, and state initiatives embedded into institutional goals. (1.3)

BCC's Educational Master Plan is an example of a well-integrated planning process and links the college's mission, goals, and strategic priorities to BCC's various committees and leadership. For resource allocation, decision-making and long-term planning, BCC relies on frequent program review (every 2-3 years) to discover potential weaknesses within the institution. The program review templates, which are based on a thorough evaluation of program goals, objectives, and data, guide the resource requests and ensure that these requests are a logical continuation of the review process. For example, when a review of the Kinesiology program revealed the need to refurbish the tennis courts in order to safely provide a wider array of course offerings, the program review template provided a place for the program to request the supplies and staffing needed to reach that goal. The program review process also shows demonstrated evidence of continuous improvement. For example, program planning revealed deficiencies in BCC's curriculum, prompting an overhaul of all BCC courses and programs. Furthermore, program review is an opportunity for each program to ensure its mission aligns and supports the college's mission. BCC's Program review Subcommittee (PRSC) ensures that program review is complete and reports to the Institutional Effectiveness Committee (IEC). Both the PRSC and IEC represent institutional constituencies. (1.4)

BCC regularly communicates the results of progress on ISS, VFS goals, enrollment, institutional data, and student success metrics to the public through online dashboards, presentations to committees, the BCC website, publications, and email newsletters. Program reviews, as well as the Program Review Trends Report are publicly available through the BCC website. Institutional data sets are used to author program reviews and are critical for evaluating progress toward goals, including an analysis of strengths, weaknesses, opportunities, and threats (SWOT). (1.5)

Conclusions:

The Institution meets Standards 1.1, 1.2, 1.3, 1.4, 1.5.

Standard 2

Student Success

General Observations:

Barstow Community College demonstrates its commitment to its students through its academic offerings, and instructional and non-instructional programs. The commitment to high-quality programs responsive to student needs is evidenced by the college's program review process. The College collects and uses data about student needs and student outcomes to inform academic offerings and support services that promote equitable student learning and success. The College is actively engaging in faculty professional development, dialogue and policy revisions to ensure that regular and substantive interaction is exhibited in all distance education offerings.

Findings and Evidence:

The team reviewed Barstow Community College's catalog and found that the College offers degrees and certificates appropriate to its mission and that programs of study reflect appropriate depth, breadth, and expected learning outcomes. The process for curriculum design, development, and review are supported through established participatory governance and BPs. The technical review and curriculum committees evaluate new and modified programs and courses. The visiting team reviewed BP/AP 4020, the Participatory Governance Handbook, and the Curriculum Development Timeline and Workflow which describe the curriculum process, the role of participatory governance in that process, and the steps for the submission, review, and approval of curricula and found that the fields of study are consistent with the institution's mission and have the appropriate breadth, depth, and expected learning outcomes. Routine course review takes place on a 6-year review cycle with a focus on currency, quality, relevance and rigor with course review embedded in program review. Distance education offerings, which include online, hybrid, hyflex and web enhanced modalities, follow the Chancellor's Office CVC-OEI course design rubric. The visiting team reviewed the instructional program review institutional processes flow and DE proposal form documents. (2.1)

Barstow Community College faculty oversee the curriculum to ensure discipline and industry standards are met. The College reviews courses using a feedback rubric developed by their Program Review Subcommittee (PRSC) and self-evaluation process. Course Student Learning Outcomes (SLOs) are included in course outlines. The curriculum review process includes an examination of program structure and outcomes, involves external partner input where appropriate, identifies student needs to meet discipline and industry standards, and is beginning to incorporate equity into curriculum design and development. The visiting team reviewed the cosmetology advisory minutes, the online equity rubric and college equity statement. The College has sought to increase the use of Open Educational Resources (OER)

and ZTC (Zero Textbook Cost) to address student access and affordability and has developed three ethnic studies courses to meet California State University requirements and move toward creating a more inclusive curriculum. The visiting team reviewed the ethnic studies syllabi and the documentation in minutes and emails confirming receipt of the Zero Textbook Cost acceleration grant. (2.2)

The College has a general education framework detailed in its catalog and Board Policies that articulate the role of general education in leading students to understand themselves in relation to cultural diversity and the modern world. To verify this, the visiting team reviewed the BCC General Education Philosophy statement and BP/AP 4025. Integral to general education, the College has also established institutional learning outcomes. The visiting team reviewed the college's institutional learning outcomes webpage as part of its evidence review. General education requirements are aligned to support transfer to public in state four-year institutions, fulfill local degree requirements, and provide students with numerous opportunities to engage and explore a wide range of disciplines. (2.3)

The College communicates its credit and non-credit programs and offerings through its catalog and addresses the needs of students planning to enter the workforce directly, those pursuing education to pursue promotion opportunities, as well as those seeking to transfer. The visiting team reviewed the BCC Resource Hub, the student services webpage, the Basic Skills Education Program Certificate, and the Guided Pathways webpage. The catalog is available on its website. Students can also gain access to course offerings and SLOs through Canvas. Through the College's website, catalog, and LMS, students, faculty, and staff can access campus resources, with communications often being made available in Spanish as noted through the review of the multiple language event communications evidence. The College has engaged a consultant to build multiple communication plans and provide targeted communication to former, current, and prospective students as well as school districts, regional partners, and colleges and universities to promote career and educational pathways. (2.4)

The College has implemented a master two-year schedule and uses time blocks for scheduling. The implementation of these tools has led to accelerated student unit completion coupled with a 70% average course success rate. The visiting team reviewed the Tableau Dashboards and noted the increase in enrollments and steady or increased rates of degree and certificate completion. The College coordinates scheduling meetings to facilitate the timely completion of degrees, certificates, and transfer. The College's Distance Education program tracks completion of online Associate Degrees for Transfer (ADT) and Certifications of Achievement (COA) and is attentive to flexible scheduling at their Fort Irwin site, in support of military enrollments and completion. The visiting team reviewed the online only trackers for the ADT/COA and the Fort Irwin rotational planning email and calendar. The College engages in marketing and outreach to increase student enrollments. The review and analysis of scheduling and course completion data is embedded in program review as reflected in the instructional program review template. (2.5)

The College offers courses in multiple modalities and evaluates the effectiveness of course delivery modalities through instructional program review, review of student trends and demands, classroom technology, and transfer institution modality requirements. The College organizes faculty forums to share equitable teaching methodologies and share resources and provides faculty professional development and training on teaching online, ADA compliance, and culturally responsive instructional practices. The visiting team was able to confirm professional development offerings focused on equitable online learning through its review of the Distance Education and Instructional Technology Committee (DEITC) Two Year Professional Development Schedule. The visiting team reviewed the BCC Educational Policies and Guidelines Packet which details the standards for online courses. The visiting team also reviewed 15 of the Spring 2024 online course offerings and an additional sample of 15 Distance Education courses from Fall 2024 leading up to the focused site visit. The team examined online courses in Canvas, taking care to explore the announcements, modules, assignments, feedback and grading, responses to student inquiries, and discussions for evidence of regular and substantive interaction.

The team compliments the faculty, staff and administrators for their responsiveness to the core inquiry and collaborative work that went into providing additional information related to addressing the distance education standard. The team notes that the college provided information that was useful and demonstrated that rich conversations about regular and substantive interaction are taking place. While a good number of courses met the standard for regular and substantive interaction, the final sample set reviewed by the team did not meet the 85% threshold for substantive and regular interaction.

Barstow Community College has drafted an updated policies and guidelines document related to distance education. The dean of instruction is also providing additional feedback and support to faculty as the institution pursues robust regular and substantive interaction in online offerings. Through its policies and practices, the college has demonstrated a commitment to ensuring instructor engagement and the team is optimistic that the college is on track to meet this accreditation standard. (2.6)

The College uses student surveys to identify student needs for academic and non-academic services. Survey results are used to make decisions about the use of funds such as Higher Education Emergency Relief Funds, and to determine the scope of program offerings and associated staffing needs. The visiting team reviewed the OIR Newsletter which summarizes study survey findings and documents changes in service offerings. The College employs student success advisors to assist new and current students with enrollment-related functions and connection to support services. The College embeds student success advisors into student services functions and embeds librarians and tutors into various course formats. The team reviewed the Library, Math Center, Writing Center, and Teaching and Learning Support Center Webpages which detail the library and learning resources available to students at Barstow College. The College's efforts related to placement and successful completion of transfer level math and English has been recognized by two external awards. Counseling faculty are engaged in regular professional development to meet institutional outcomes and student needs. The

College offers mental health services for individuals and student groups that take into consideration student identities, format preferences, and needs as reflected on the Mindful Space Student support groups flyer. The College participated in the Housing and Homeless Insecurity Program grant and has implemented a transfer plan that includes collaboration with Historically Black Colleges & Universities and Hispanic Serving Institutions. The visiting team reviewed the 2023-25 Transfer Center Plan which details activities such as tours and workshops to promote HSIs and HBCUs opportunities with students. Data from surveys and college metrics about student services that address academic and non-academic needs are reviewed by the college's Enrollment Management and Student Equity & Achievement committees. The visiting team confirmed this through review of the college's Student Equity & Achievement Plan and the Enrollment Services Program Review. (2.7)

The College fosters a sense of belonging and community through in person and virtual events at the beginning of each term, through student clubs and organizations, including Associated Student Government, and through organized events that celebrate and honor student identities and cultures. The College has engaged in innovative practices to build a sense of community and provide opportunities for engagement, including a partnership with SolveCC and a student essay contest. The visiting team reviewed flyers and promotional materials about leadership activities, workshops, cultural and identity-based events, as well as student essays as evidence of the college's efforts to foster a sense of belonging. Efforts to create and strengthen sense of belonging and community are reviewed and assessed through non-instructional program reviews as verified through a review of the Mindful Space and Special Programs and Services program review updates. (2.8)

The College conducts systematic review and assessment of its instructional and noninstructional programs over a three-year cycle (2 years for career and technical education) through program review. The review process includes the development, review, reflection and adjustment of course student learning outcomes. The College has data dashboards to support the assessment of programs at both the course and program level. The visiting team reviewed the Instructional Program Student Learning Outcomes data which provides disaggregated demographic data by outcome. The College reviews its ILOs (Institutional Learning Outcomes) every two years. The College seeks to intentionally set aside time for reflection about assessment tools and data collection to close the loop for student learning outcomes as evidenced by the establishment of its weeklong program review days series. As part of the College's program review and assessment, the Student Equity & Achievement Committee has established goals and metrics to address student equity gaps and institutional barriers impacting student populations. The visiting team reviewed the Student Equity & Achievement documents (goals and metrics and input for disproportionally impacted student groups) as evidence of the college's systematic review and assessment in support of equitable student achievement. (2.9)

Conclusions:

The College meets Standards 2.1, 2.2, 2.3, 2.4, 2.5, 2.7, 2.8, 2.9 The College does not meet Standard 2.6 Recommendation 1: In order to meet the Standard, the team recommends the College ensures regular and substantive interaction is occurring in all its distance education courses (Standard 2.6, Policy on Distance Education and Correspondence Education)

Standard 3

Infrastructure and Resources

General Observations:

Barstow Community College's infrastructure and resources are governed through Board Policy, Administrative Procedures, and college-wide planning documents. The college utilizes its annual program review process to identify infrastructure and resource needs within the institution and allocates its available resources to meet these needs. The college develops the institution's annual budget using budget development calendars, budget assumptions, and analysis of current and historical revenue and expenditure trends. Barstow Community College makes an effort to align this work with strategic planning documents such as the Comprehensive Master Plan, Five-Year Capital Outlay Plan, and Five-Year Technology Plan. The college uses these plans, along with strategic goals, institutional initiatives, and measurable outcomes in their resource allocation process. Also, Barstow Community College implements program review processes in determining staffing needs and maintains district-wide resources and policies to support effective hiring practices. The college also provides and tracks employee professional development opportunities and annual evaluations of existing employees.

Findings and Evidence:

Barstow Community College has a developed process to establish appropriate staffing levels for the institution to support its mission, programs, and operations. The college utilizes the annual program review process to identify position requests within the institution and allocates its available resources to meet these needs. The visiting team reviewed the program review handbook and an example of a position requisition form. The program review cycle follows an established process which concludes with review, approval, and resource allocation by the Superintendent/President's Cabinet. The college also continuously reviews and improves the institution's staffing structure through adjustments to job classifications and descriptions to ensure the institution is properly structured. The college's job positions include the necessary information for the candidates and a screening committee to verify that the applicants meet the qualifications for the position. The visiting team reviewed hiring committee training materials and the district's committee screening and interview guidelines. The college has procedures in place that strive for viable and large candidate pools. The visiting team reviewed Board Policy and Administrative Procedure 7120 which indicate that Barstow Community College has existing Board Policies and Administrative Procedures related to their commitment to diversity that govern their recruitment and applicant screening process. (3.1)

Barstow Community College provides professional development opportunities to their employees that promote personal and professional growth. College faculty, staff, and administrators are annually provided opportunities to attend conferences, professional workshops, and statewide professional development collaborations. The visiting team reviewed the district's professional development plans, employee training agendas, and professional development schedules of training opportunities. These professional development opportunities align with the college's mission, institutional goals, and equitable student success, such as the institutional commitment to participate in the Student Equity Planning Institute (SEPI), which was reviewed by the visiting team. The college provides employees with state mandated training programs such as sexual harassment and equal opportunity employment as evident through Keenen Safe Colleges assignments and management sexual harassment training correspondence. The college annually allocates resources to its professional development program and maintains professional development plan criteria overseen by the college's Professional Development Committee. The visiting team reviewed the Professional Development Committee's purpose and description as well as the college's Professional Development Committee is professional development criteria are reviewed and revised through the shared governance process. (3.2)

Barstow Community College regularly evaluates its employees in accordance with district policies, procedures, and collective bargaining agreements. The visiting team reviewed the evaluation tracking lists maintained for different employee groups. The college provides training to evaluators to ensure they understand their role and the role of the evaluation process in meeting the institutional mission and goals, which is evident through management evaluation training materials provided as evidence to the visiting team. Barstow College has evolved its evaluation training materials to include recognizing and overcoming implicit bias. The college's human resources department works with appropriate deans to ensure employee evaluations are tracked and completed promptly. Barstow College provided evidence of college-wide evaluation tracking and completed status by employee group. The college has policies and procedures in place to implement performance improvement plans and ensure that evaluators have enough professional exposure to their direct reports to provide meaningful feedback. The visiting team reviewed collective bargaining agreements and the Classified Professional Performance Improvement Plan to verify that procedures are in place for employee improvement opportunities. (3.3)

Barstow Community College's annual budget development and resource allocation process is governed by Board Policy. Board Policy 6200, which was reviewed by the visiting team, outlines the process for budget development and requires connection with college master planning. The college's budget policies and procedures require the development of budget assumptions that are reviewed by the Governing Board as well as specific minimum reserve balances to be maintained in the unrestricted general fund (25%). The visiting team reviewed the 2023-24 Adopted Budget which outlined the annual budget assumptions for the district. The college defines and evaluates their annual budget development process and its connection with institutional goals through including the budget development process in the institution's Program Review Handbook. Barstow Community College connects their annual program review cycle and departmental resource request to the annual budget development process and resource allocation, which was evident through review of the 2023-24 annual budget development calendar provided to the visiting team as evidence. This connection is further defined in the Program Review Handbook and BAP form. Departmental requests are submitted

through the Budget Allocation Proposal (BAP) forms, which are evaluated in accordance with the college's plans, goals, and expected measurable outcomes. The visiting team reviewed the BAP forms and noted that they connect resource requests to institutional plans, goals, and measurable outcomes. (3.4)

Barstow Community College's annual budget development process begins with budget assumptions that mirror the institution's mission and goals. These assumptions also align with governing board policy, specifically Board Policy 6200. To verify this, the visiting team reviewed the 2023-24 Adopted Budget as well as the 2023-24 Budget Development Calendar. The college utilizes its participatory Business and Finance Committee to review the budget process along with college revenues and expenditures. The Business and Finance Committee meeting minutes reflect their role in overseeing the linkage between annual planning, resource allocation, and district budgeting practices. The college provided minutes from multiple committee meetings showing the committee's work in reviewing college finances, budget documents and assumptions. Barstow Community College is currently working on redesigning the Business and Finance Committee's structure to strengthen the connection between the committee and district actual spending and future budget decisions, such as funding reductions. The institution routinely updates the governing board and the public on their financial position through regular board reports. These public reports include grant resources available to the college, current financial position, and future projections. The visiting team reviewed board meeting agendas and presentation materials. (3.5)

Barstow Community College's governing Board of Trustees oversees the financial position and performance through review of monthly financial statements. This evaluation includes a review of monthly revenues and expenditures as well as the financial trends of the institution. The visiting team reviewed board meeting agendas, minutes, and presentation materials as evidence of these actions. Furthermore, the staff at Barstow Community College provide the Board with information regarding the state budget and its impact on their local budget, such as the state reduction to scheduled maintenance funding, which promoted financial diligence at Barstow Community College in their committed local funding for ongoing and emergency facility repairs. The college provided board meeting minutes as evidence of the staff presentation on the 2023-24 state budget. Barstow Community College maintains a governing policy that requires annual independent audits of their financial statements, which was evident through Board Policy. In past years when audit findings have been reported, the college has developed corrective action plans to implement to correct the findings in the subsequent fiscal year. In the 2022-23 fiscal year, Barstow Community College received their audit report with no findings of significant deficiencies or material weaknesses. The visiting team reviewed prior year audit reports available on the public website and the 2022-23 fiscal year audit as part of the evidence review. (3.6)

Barstow Community College has processes in place to monitor financial trends and activities to ensure the college is meeting their fiscal needs. Short-range planning includes review and analysis of current and prior year revenue and expenditure trends which aid the college in making financial adjustments to meet short-term fiscal needs. The visiting team reviewed

district presentation materials for the unrestricted and restricted general funds. In the college's budget development planning cycle, the state budget is analyzed to develop long-range financial projections for the college to ensure the institution can meet its board policy requirement of 25% reserves, which is evident through Board Policy 6200 and the college's 2022-23 Budget Development Calendar. These budget and financial forecasting activities align with the college's governing board policy and procedure 6200. The College also utilizes financial tools provided by the County, specifically Financial 2000. This software provides district leadership with tools to manage the college's funds throughout the fiscal year, which was apparent through the district providing evidence of the system platform. In addition, the college maintains a financial trust for their post-employment health benefit program through the California Employers' Retiree Benefit Trust (CERBT). The college undergoes an annual actuarial evaluation to determine funding needs and identify payment forecasts for their post-retirement health benefit liability. The visiting team reviewed trust documents, such as the annual trust report and quarterly trust statements. (3.7)

The College prioritizes funding and resource allocation for their physical assets through inclusion of both their Comprehensive Master Plan and Strategic Plan. The visiting team reviewed the district's 2017 Comprehensive Master Plan and 2019-24 Strategic Priority 4. The College has recently expanded their educational facility footprint through a newly constructed building for the career and technical education programs. Furthermore, the college is periodically renovating and remodeling existing college facilities such as their new faculty development area. The visiting team reviewed college presentation materials as evidence of the creation of this new faculty development area. Barstow College utilizes the Chancellor's Office FUSION2 system to report, track, and prioritize schedule maintenance needs throughout the district. Through this process, the college identifies areas of high need and begins seeking funding to address them, such as their initial project proposal submission to the Chancellor's Office for a new classroom building. The visiting team reviewed the college's five-year capital outlay plan, the new classroom initial project proposal (IPP), and the facilities condition index. Barstow College also conducts an annual property inspection performed by their insurance carrier. The results of this annual inspection are used to address areas of safety concern on their campuses. The visiting team reviewed the property inspection report dated June 23, 2023. (3.8)

The College has developed goals and standards for technology resources in their Information Technology (IT) Strategic Plan, which was reviewed by the visiting team. The long-term technology goals are outlined in the college's five-year technology plan, which is for the fiscal years of 2017-22. The college recognizes that these technology plans need updating, so college leadership has tasked the participatory governance body, The Technology Committee, to review and update the planning documents. The committee completed their first review of the documents in March of 2024 as documented in their committee minutes. The visiting team reviewed these materials and identified that the technology plans were on the agenda for updating. To ensure technology updates, bulletins, and best practices, which is evident through review of past correspondence to the campus community, specifically college-wide cybersecurity emails. The team confirms that the college has guidelines for safe and

appropriate technology use for all users, including students. Additionally, the college has implemented the software Forsyte which provides security firewalls for the college's data and monitor technology access within the district. The visiting team reviewed the Forsyte Technology Assessment provided to the visiting team as evidence. Technology resources are also included in the college's program review process, which allows departments to request resources for their specific technology needs, which is evident in the college's technology budget augmentation proposal and program review documents. (3.9)

Barstow Community College uses Keenan & Associates for their risk management services. This agreement provides the district with integrated loss control and safety solutions. The college also participates in a Hazardous Materials Compliance Program which assists the college with identifying, tracking, and storing hazardous materials within their district. Barstow Community College also participates in the cyber liability program which provides coverage and protection from any data breaches through cyber-attacks, which was evident through the visiting team's review of the insurance premium proforma. The district also maintains an Injury and Illness Prevention Plan (IIPP) and an Emergency Response Plan, both reviewed by the visiting team. The institution is a participant in the Statewide Association of Community College (SWACC) joint-powers authority for property and liability coverage and has also received board approval to establish their self-insurance fund to record premium payments and process outstanding claims. The visiting team reviewed the SWACC premium summary provided as evidence which outlines the insurance coverage the college has for liability, property, crime, and technology. (3.10)

Conclusions:

The Institution meets Standards 3.1, 3.2, 3.3, 3.4, 3.5, 3.6, 3.7, 3.8, 3.9, 3.10.

Standard 4

Governance and Decision-Making

General Observations:

Barstow Community College demonstrates effective governance practices, such as readily available policies and administrative procedures, while encouraging the meaningful participation of stakeholders and pursuing its mission.

Board members have demonstrated a commitment to academic freedom and integrity, as well as transparency in decision-making through its conflict-of-interest policy. Barstow Community College has also established a calendar of meetings, and public-facing college goals and measurable activities.

Board policies and procedures are regularly reviewed and updated at Barstow Community College. While there is a participatory governance model, leveraged in its recent curricular reset, it remains an ever-present challenge to inform all stakeholders of the purpose, rights and responsibilities of participatory governance.

Findings and Evidence:

Barstow Community College and its board of trustees are committed to principles of academic freedom, academic integrity, and freedom of inquiry as evidenced in its Board Policy 5500 and Administrative Procedure 5520. The visiting team reviewed the Academic Senate Bylaws and Constitution also reflect the college's commitment to academic freedom, integrity, and freedom of inquiry. There are several examples of college-wide engagement on important issues such as racism, religious beliefs and domestic violence, such as the college's selection of the book "There There" by Tommy Orange for the Barstow Reads Project. The visiting team reviewed the college catalog and student handbook which explains academic dishonesty while providing procedures for addressing violations (discussed in Administrative Procedure 5520). Moreover, in 2023 the institution implemented Simplicity Advocate, a software management program for student conduct issues, including academic dishonesty. (4.1)

The visiting team reviewed Board Policy and Administrative Procedure 2510 which explicitly states the roles, responsibilities and authority given to all constituent groups including the Board of Trustees, Superintendent-President, the Academic Senate (including 10+1 matters) and Associated Students (guided by (9+1 policies and issues), as well as administrators, BCFA and CSEA (faculty and classified professional unions). The roles, responsibilities and rights of decision-making of all constituency groups are clearly defined, while the College Governance Council is responsible for disseminating the Participatory Governance Handbook. The team confirmed that the roles, responsibilities and rights of decision-making of all constituency groups are clearly defined for disseminating the College Governance Handbook. The team confirmed that the roles, responsibilities and rights of decision-making of all constituency groups are clearly defined for disseminating the College Governance Handbook.

disseminating the Participatory Governance Handbook. The Participatory Handbook functions as the primary resource for communicating the committee structure, roles and responsibilities, and connection to college plans. (4.2)

The team confirms that Board responsibilities are defined in Board Policy 2200, revised to include the Board's responsibility to monitor equitable student outcomes, and at the December 20, 2023 Board Meeting, the board approved revisions to the district's mission, vision and values to ensure commitment to Diversity Equity and Inclusion. To ensure that decision-making structures and processes are used effectively, the college performs an annual survey that evaluates the effectiveness of the governance process. While there is evidence in the annual Committee Effectiveness Survey of some "unfamiliarity with the mechanisms, or uncertain of the efficacy, of participatory governance", the evaluation process yielded improvements to address concerns. Examples provided include the improvements in the student governance structure and the process for faculty hiring as well as emphasizing institutional learning outcomes and centering the governance process around student and community needs. (4.3)

Barstow Community College's Board recently adopted a new Board Goal, Goal 7, which codified their expectation to receive regular reports and presentations relating to the implementation of the college's strategic plan performance on the Vision for Success goals and the institution set standards. The visiting team reviewed the annual board calendar of presentations, published board goals, and meeting minutes. Further, the visiting team reviewed Board Policy 6200, Budget Preparation, which holds the Board responsible for fiscal management and oversight. This policy outlines a mandated audited reserve balance of at least 25%, which is intended to ensure the fiscal stability of the district and the district's ability to respond to unforeseen circumstances and emergencies. The visiting team reviewed Board budget presentations and budget reserve documents and noted the district-maintained reserves over the last three years at levels between 34-47%. (4.4)

Board Policy 2430 clearly outlines the delegation of administrative authority to the chief administrator and highlights that the chief executive is expected to fulfill the duties as described in the job description. The governing board adheres to its policies for delegation of administrative authority to the chief administrator, which includes an annual evaluation of the chief administrator in alignment with Board Policies, the chief executive job description, and employment contract. BCC's Governing Board uses a fair and open candidate search process to select its superintendent-president. The job description for the BCC chief administrator sets clear expectations for regular reports, including the responsibility for timely reporting and additional duties during annual goal-setting or evaluation sessions. (4.5)

Barstow Community College's board duties and responsibilities, which include defining the institutional mission, setting legal standards for college operations, assuring fiscal health and stability, and monitoring institutional performance and educational quality, are delineated in BPs 2200 and 2210. The visiting team reviewed trustee documents which state the expectation that trustees are advocates and ambassadors for the college and demonstrate their support for board policies and decisions. The frequency with which the board reaches unanimous decisions

when voting supports the fulfillment of these expectations. The board has a code of ethics and conflict of interest policy, as documented through BPs 2710 and 2715, and begins all meetings with a statement to confirm their commitment to behave according to their code of ethics and act in the public's trust as evidence. The visiting team confirmed this through review of board policies and board meeting agendas. The BCC Board members have a new trustee orientation, self-evaluation, and study sessions in support of board effectiveness. The board engages in professional development opportunities and institutionally relevant documents are easily accessible to all board members. In addition, Barstow Community College provides evidence of trustee participation in training offered by the Community College League of California in 2023. When there are known conflicts, the Barstow Community College board has a practice of acknowledging the conflict on the board agenda and having the party in question recuse themselves from the discussion and all actions associated with the item in question. Similarly, all board members file their Form 700 annually which is detailed as a standing practice and procedure in Board Policy 2710 and Administrative Procedure 2712. (4.6)

Conclusions:

The Institution meets Standards 4.1, 4.2, 4.3, 4.4, 4.5, 4.6.

Verification of Required Documentation

The evaluation items detailed in this Checklist are those which fall specifically under federal regulations and related Commission policies, beyond what is articulated in the Accreditation Standards. Some required documentation may have been used in response to ACCJC Standards that address the same or similar subject matter. For each required item listed, the team must verify its review of the required documentation, and indicated its conclusion by choosing one of the options below and note any comment or concerns where needed:

Verified	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements.
Verified, with Recommendations for improvement	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements, but improvement is recommended.
Not met	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the institution does not meet the Commission's requirements.

Standard 1: Mission and Institutional Effectiveness

Re	quired Item	Conclusions
i	Documentation of institution's authority to operate as a post-secondary educational institution and award degrees (e.g., degree-granting approval statement, authorization to operate, articles of incorporation) (ER 1)	X_Verified Verified, with Recommendation(s) for improvement Not met Recommendation(s) for improvement:
ii.	Procedures/practices for periodic review of mission/mission-related statements, including provisions for revision (if/when revisions are needed) that allow for participation of institutional stakeholders, as appropriate for the character and context of the institution	XVerified Verified, with Recommendation(s) for improvement Not met Recommendation(s) for improvement:
iii.	Documentation of the governing board's approval of the institutional mission (ER 6)	XVerified Verified, with Recommendation(s) for improvement Not met Recommendation(s) for improvement:
iv.	Procedures/practices for setting institutional goals, including provisions for the inclusion of input from relevant institutional stakeholders, as appropriate for the character and context of the institution	XVerified Verified, with Recommendation(s) for improvement Not met Recommendation(s) for improvement :

v.	Documentation that the institution has established standards and goals for student achievement (i.e., institution-set standards), including but not limited to standards and goals for course success, degree and certificate attainment, transfer, job placement rates, and licensure examination pass rates, at the institutional and program levels (ER 2, ER 11)	XVerified Verified, with Recommendation(s) for improvement Not met Recommendation(s) for improvement:
----	--	--

Standard 2: Student Success

Required Item	Conclusions
 Documentation that the institution's practices for awarding credit reflect generally accepted norms in higher education, including: Commonly accepted minimum program lengths for certificates, associate degrees, and baccalaureate degrees Written policies for determining credit hours that are consistently applied to all courses, programs, and modalities Adherence to the Department of Education's standards for clock-to-credit hour conversions, if applicable (ER 10) (See Commission <i>Policy on Credit Hour, Clock Hour, and</i> <i>Academic Year</i>) 	_XVerified Verified, with Recommendation(s) for improvement Not met Recommendation(s) for improvement:
 ii. Documentation that the institution's transfer of credit policies include the following: Any established criteria the institution uses regarding the transfer of credit earned at another institution Any types of institutions or sources from which the institution will not accept credits A list of institutions with which the institution has established an articulation agreement Written criteria used to evaluate and award credit for prior learning experience including, but not limited to, service in the armed forces, paid or unpaid employment, or other demonstrated competency or learning 	XVerified Verified, with Recommendation(s) for improvement Not met Recommendation(s) for improvement:
 See <u>Policy on Transfer of Credit</u> iii. Documentation of the institution's advertising and recruitment policies, demonstrating alignment with the <u>Policy on Institutional Advertising and Student</u> <u>Recruitment</u> (ER 16) 	XVerified Verified, with Recommendation(s) for improvement Not met Recommendation(s) for improvement:

Re	quired Item	Conclusions
iv.	 Documentation of clear policies and procedures for handling student complaints, including: Evidence that these policies/procedures are accessible to students in the catalog and online; Evidence that that institution provides contact information for filing complaints with associations, agencies and governmental bodies that accredit, approve, or license the institution and any of its programs 	_XVerified Verified, with Recommendation(s) for improvement Not met Recommendation(s) for improvement:
v.	 Verification that the institution maintains files of formal student complaints received throughout the current accreditation cycle (i.e., since the last site visit), demonstrating: Accurate and consistent implementation of complaint policies and procedures No issues indicative of noncompliance with Standards 	XVerified Verified, with Recommendation(s) for improvement Not met Recommendation(s) for improvement:
vi.	Verification that student records are stored permanently, securely, and confidentially, with provision for secure backup	XVerified Verified, with Recommendation(s) for improvement Not met Recommendation(s) for improvement:
vii.	Documentation of the institution's policies and/or practices for the release of student records	_XVerified Verified, with Recommendation(s) for improvement Not met Recommendation(s) for improvement:
viii.	. Documentation that the institution's policies and procedures for program discontinuance provide enrolled students with opportunities for timely completion in the event of program elimination	_XVerified Verified, with Recommendation(s) for improvement Not met Recommendation(s) for improvement:
	Official college catalog contains required elements (ER 20)	XVerified Verified, with Recommendation(s) for improvement Not met Recommendation(s) for improvement:

Required Item	Conclusions
 x. Documentation of institution's implementation of the required components of the Title IV Program, including: Findings from any audits and program/other review activities by the U.S. Department of Education (ED) Evidence of timely corrective action taken in response to any Title IV audits or program reviews See Policy on Institutional Compliance with Title IV 	XVerified Verified, with Recommendation(s) for improvement Not met Recommendation(s) for improvement:
FOR INSTITUTIONS WITH DISTANCE EDUCATION AND/OR CO	DRRESPONDENCE EDUCATION:
 xi. Documentation of institution's : Procedures for verifying that the student who registers in a course offered via distance education or correspondence education is the same person who participates in the course and receives academic credit Policies and/or procedures for notifying students of any charges associated with verification of student identity (if applicable) Policies regarding protection of student privacy See <u>Policy on Distance Education and on Correspondence Education</u> 	_XVerified Verified, with Recommendation(s) for improvement Not met Recommendation(s) for improvement:
REQUIRED ONLY IF APPLICABLE	
xii. Documentation demonstrating how the institution distinguishes its pre-collegiate curriculum from its college-level curriculum	_XVerified Verified, with Recommendation(s) for improvement Not met N/A Recommendation(s) for improvement:
xiii. Documentation of policies and/or procedures for awarding credit for prior learning and/or competency- based credit	_XVerified Verified, with Recommendation(s) for improvement Not met N/A Recommendation(s) for improvement:
xiv. Documentation of agreements with other external parties regarding the provision of student and/or learning support services	_XVerified Verified, with Recommendation(s) for improvement Not met N/A Recommendation(s) for improvement:

Re	quired Item	Conclusions
xv.	Policies and/or other documentation related to institutional expectations of conformity with any specific worldviews or beliefs	_XVerified Verified, with Recommendation(s) for improvement Not met N/A Recommendation(s) for improvement:

Standard 3: Infrastructure and Resources

Ch	ecklist Item	Conclusions
i.	Written policies and procedures for human resources, including hiring procedures	XVerified Verified, with Recommendation(s) for improvement Not met Recommendation(s) for improvement:
ii.	Employee handbooks or similar documents that communicate expectations to employees	X_Verified Verified, with Recommendation(s) for improvement Not met Recommendation(s) for improvement:
iii.	Annual financial audit reports - 3 prior years (include auxiliary organizations, if applicable) (ER 5)	X_Verified Verified, with Recommendation(s) for improvement Not met Recommendation(s) for improvement:
iv.	Practices for resource allocation and budget development (including budget allocation model for multi-college districts/systems)	X_Verified Verified, with Recommendation(s) for improvement Not met Recommendation(s) for improvement:
ν.	Policies guiding fiscal management (e.g., related to reserves, budget development)	X_Verified Verified, with Recommendation(s) for improvement Not met Recommendation(s) for improvement:
vi.	Policies, procedures or agreements (e.g., AUAs) related to appropriate use of technology systems	XVerified Verified, with Recommendation(s) for improvement Not met Recommendation(s) for improvement:
FO	R TITLE IV PARTICIPANTS:	

	Documentation that the institution's student loan default rates are within the acceptable range defined by ED, or – if rates fall outside the acceptable range - documentation of corrective efforts underway to address the issue	XVerified Verified, with Recommendation(s) for improvement Not met Recommendation(s) for improvement:
REQ	UIRED ONLY IF APPLICABLE	
	Documentation of any agreements that fall under ACCJC's policy on contractual relationships with non- accredited organizations	Verified Verified, with Recommendation(s) for improvement Not met X_N/A Recommendation(s) for improvement:
	Written code of professional ethics for all personnel including consequences for violations	XVerified Verified, with Recommendation(s) for improvement Not met Recommendation(s) for improvement:

Standard 4: Governance and Decision-Making

Ch	ecklist Item	Documentation
i.	Governing board policies/procedures for selecting and regularly evaluating its chief executive officer	XVerified Verified, with Recommendation(s) for improvement Not met Recommendation(s) for improvement:
ii.	Documentation or certification that the institution's CEO does not serve as the chair of the governing board (ER 4)	XVerified Verified, with Recommendation(s) for improvement Not met Recommendation(s) for improvement:
iii.	Governing board policies/procedures/bylaws related to Board Ethics	XVerified Verified, with Recommendation(s) for improvement Not met Recommendation(s) for improvement:
iv.	Governing board policies/procedures/bylaws related to conflict of interest	XVerified Verified, with Recommendation(s) for improvement Not met Recommendation(s) for improvement:

Other Federal Regulations and Related Commission Policies

Checklist Item Conclusions

i. Documentation of the institution's appropriate and timely effort to solicit third party comment in advance of the Focused Site Visit and – if applicable - cooperate with the review team in any necessary follow-up	X Verified Verified, with Recommendation(s) for improvement Not met Recommendation(s) for improvement:
See <u>Policy on Rights, Responsibilities, and Good Practice in Relations</u> with Member Institutions, Section D	
 Documentation that the institution provides accurate information for the public concerning its accredited status with ACCJC on its institutional website, no more than one page (one click) away from the home page 	X Verified Verified, with Recommendation(s) for improvement Not met Recommendation(s) for improvement:
See <u>Policy on Representation of Accredited Status</u>	